## APPENDIX 1

## Thurrock Council - Equal Pay Analysis

July 2018

```
Geoff Pearce
Managing Consultant - Reward
NGA Human Resources
July }201
```


## Contents

1. Executive Summary
2. Background
3. Workforce Composition
4. Current Pay Structure
5. Gender Pay Gap

## 1. Executive Summary

1.1 The purpose of this report is to provide an update of the current position based on the current pay structure prior to the job evaluation review using the GLPC Job Evaluation scheme which the council has agreed to implement.

## Data

1.2 The overall data set provided by the Council is based on the April payroll and includes 2,209 employees in total. This includes 2,099 employees currently paid via the main grading structure, Bands 1 to 10 . There are a number of other negotiating bodies including Soulbury and Youth and Community Workers included within the overall employment group which are included in the composition of the Workforce (Table 1) but excluded from the analysis.

## Workforce Composition

1.3 The composition of the workforce for Bands 1 to 10 shows that the workforce is predominantly female (69.22\%) and $30.78 \%$ male (Table 2). The distribution of males and females is similar although the highest percentage of male employees is at Band 4 compared to the highest grade for female employees falling at Band 3. The composition of the workforce and distribution across the grading structure will affect the overall gender pay gap.

## Gender Pay Gap

1.4 The Equalities and Human Rights Commission advise that the pay gap should be investigated where it exceeds $5.00 \%$. The overall mean gender pay gap Band 1 to 10 based on basic pay is $9.82 \%$ which compares to $17.40 \%$ for the mean pay gap for the economy as a whole. There are no individual grades where the pay gap exceeds $5.00 \%$ with the exception of Band 9.
1.5 The overall gender pay gap based on median basic pay is $11.14 \%$ which compares to $18.40 \%$ for the economy as a whole.

The mean gender pay gap based on total pay is $8.79 \%$
The median gender pay gap based on total pay is $8.51 \%$

## 1. Background

1.1 Thurrock Council is undertaking a review of its pay and grading structure which will be based on the outcomes of a Job Evaluation review using the GLPC Job Evaluation scheme.
1.2 The purpose of this report is to provide an up dated Equal Pay Analysis and confirm the key issues that need to be addressed through the design of a new pay structure. The report is primarily based on the Band 1 to Band 10 population but also provides some further analysis of the overall workforce.
1.3 The data set that has been used for this report is based on the workforce as at April 2018 and the pay data includes increments applied from April. The total workforce is 2,209 employees of which 2,099 are paid within the main Band 1 to 10 pay scales.
2. Workforce Composition
2.1 Table 1 illustrates the overall composition of the workforce. As can be seen the main population is concentrated in Bands 1 to 10 and this group contains the roles that will be subject to evaluation using the GLPC Jo Evaluation scheme. In addition to those employees paid within Bands 1 to 10 there are a number of other employment groups that includes Colleges, Soulbury and Youth and Community.
2.2 Table 2 illustrates the composition of the workforce within Bands 1 to 10 only. As can be seen Bands 1 to 10 accounts for $95.02 \%$ of the total workforce (2099/2209 employees). Within this group $30.78 \%$ of the workforce is male and $69.22 \%$ are female.

| Table 1 - Workforce Composition - All Employees |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Equal Work Group | Organisation | All Males |  |  | All Females |  |  |
|  | Total | Total | \% of Group | \% of All Males | Total | \% of Group | \% of All <br> Females |
| Apprentice | 29 | 12 | 41.38 | 1.76 | 17 | 58.62 | 1.11 |
| Band 1 | 83 | 5 | 6.02 | 0.73 | 78 | 93.98 | 5.11 |
| Band 2 | 60 | 15 | 25.00 | 2.20 | 45 | 75.00 | 2.95 |
| Band 3 | 316 | 20 | 6.33 | 2.93 | 296 | 93.67 | 19.38 |
| Band 4 | 481 | 222 | 46.15 | 32.55 | 259 | 53.85 | 16.96 |
| Band 5 | 354 | 98 | 27.68 | 14.37 | 256 | 72.32 | 16.76 |
| Band 6 | 298 | 85 | 28.52 | 12.46 | 213 | 71.48 | 13.95 |
| Band 7 | 254 | 94 | 37.01 | 13.78 | 160 | 62.99 | 10.48 |
| Band 8 | 155 | 62 | 40.00 | 9.09 | 93 | 60.00 | 6.09 |
| Band 9 | 60 | 29 | 48.33 | 4.25 | 31 | 51.67 | 2.03 |
| Band 10 | 38 | 16 | 42.11 | 2.35 | 22 | 57.89 | 1.44 |
| CEX | 1 | 0 | - | - | 1 | 100.00 | 0.07 |
| CTLS | 4 | 0 | - | - | 4 | 100.00 | 0.26 |
| DIR1 | 5 | 1 | 20.00 | 0.15 | 4 | 80.00 | 0.26 |
| DIR2 | 1 | 1 | 100.00 | 0.15 | 0 | - | - |
| DIR4 | 1 | 1 | 100.00 | 0.15 | 0 | - | - |
| DIR5 | 2 | 2 | 100.00 | 0.29 | 0 | - | - |
| HOS3 | 3 | 3 | 100.00 | 0.44 | 0 | - | - |
| HOS5 | 5 | 4 | 80.00 | 0.59 | 1 | 20.00 | 0.07 |
| L00 | 2 | 0 | - | - | 2 | 100.00 | 0.13 |
| LECTURERS | 15 | 1 | 6.67 | 0.15 | 14 | 93.33 | 0.92 |
| LSC | 2 | 0 | - | - | 2 | 100.00 | 0.13 |
| P05 | 1 | 0 | - | - | 1 | 100.00 | 0.07 |
| PRINCIPAL | 1 | 0 | - | - | 1 | 100.00 | 0.07 |
| SOULA | 1 | 0 | - | - | 1 | 100.00 | 0.07 |
| SOULB | 5 | 2 | 40.00 | 0.29 | 3 | 60.00 | 0.20 |
| SOULC | 11 | 4 | 36.36 | 0.59 | 7 | 63.64 | 0.46 |
| Spot | 12 | 2 | 16.67 | 0.29 | 10 | 83.33 | 0.65 |
| VICEPRINC | 1 | 1 | 100.00 | 0.15 | 0 | - | - |
| YCSW | 3 | 1 | 33.33 | 0.15 | 2 | 66.67 | 0.13 |
| YTHPROF | 5 | 1 | 20.00 | 0.15 | 4 | 80.00 | 0.26 |
| Total | 2209 | 682 | 30.87 | 100.00 | 1527 | 69.13 | 100.00 |


| Table 2 - Workforce Composition - Bands 1 to 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Equal Work Group | Organisation |  | All Males |  | All Females |  |  |
|  | Total | Total | \% of <br> Group | \% of All Males | Total | \% of Group | \% of All <br> Females |
| Band 1 | 83 | 5 | 6.02 | 0.77 | 78 | 93.98 | 5.37 |
| Band 2 | 60 | 15 | 25.00 | 2.32 | 45 | 75.00 | 3.10 |
| Band 3 | 316 | 20 | 6.33 | 3.10 | 296 | 93.67 | 20.37 |
| Band 4 | 481 | 222 | 46.15 | 34.37 | 259 | 53.85 | 17.83 |
| Band 5 | 354 | 98 | 27.68 | 15.17 | 256 | 72.32 | 17.62 |
| Band 6 | 298 | 85 | 28.52 | 13.16 | 213 | 71.48 | 14.66 |
| Band 7 | 254 | 94 | 37.01 | 14.55 | 160 | 62.99 | 11.01 |
| Band 8 | 155 | 62 | 40.00 | 9.60 | 93 | 60.00 | 6.40 |
| Band 9 | 60 | 29 | 48.33 | 4.49 | 31 | 51.67 | 2.13 |
| Band 10 | 38 | 16 | 42.11 | 2.48 | 22 | 57.89 | 1.51 |
| Total | $\mathbf{2 0 9 9}$ | $\mathbf{6 4 6}$ | $\mathbf{3 0 . 7 8}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 4 5 3}$ | $\mathbf{6 9 . 2 2}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0}$ |

2.3 Table 2A shows the percentage of the workforce by Band as well as Gender and is also illustrated in Graph 1.

| Table 2A - Percentage of Workforce by Band and Gender - Band 1 to 10 |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Equal Work Group | \% of Total <br> Workforce | \% of All Males | \% of All Females |
| Band 1 | 3.95 | 0.77 | 5.37 |
| Band 2 | 2.86 | 2.32 | 3.10 |
| Band 3 | 15.05 | 3.10 | 20.37 |
| Band 4 | 22.92 | 34.37 | 17.83 |
| Band 5 | 16.87 | 15.17 | 17.62 |
| Band 6 | 14.20 | 13.16 | 14.66 |
| Band 7 | 12.10 | 14.55 | 11.01 |
| Band 8 | 7.38 | 9.60 | 6.40 |
| Band 9 | 2.86 | 4.49 | 2.13 |
| Band 10 | 1.81 | 2.48 | 1.51 |
| Total | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 0}$ |

2.4 As can be seen from Table 2A the most populated Band for the workforce as a whole is Band 4. Band 4 is also the most populated Band for male employees whereas the most populated Band for females is Band 3. It is also evident that it is more likely that female employees will be in Bands 1 and 2 compared to male employees and those male employees are more likely to be in Bands 9 and 10 compared to female employees.
2.5 The type of role that is within Bands 1,2 and 3 includes a range of Care related and Administrative roles which are more likely to be undertaken by female employees reflecting a level of occupational segregation. The employees within these grades are
also predominantly part time. There are 459 employees in Bands 1, 2 and 3 of which 419 are female and 349 work on a part time basis. Within the economy as a whole women are still more likely to work on a part time basis due to family responsibilities and it is therefore more likely that they will be in this type of role.

## Graph 1 - Distribution of Workforce by Band and Gender


_ \% of Total Workforce
_ \% of All Males
\% of All Females

Band 1Band 2Band 3Band 4Band 5Band 6Band 7Band 8Band 9 Band

## 3. Current Pay Structure

3.1 The current pay structure is shown in Table 3. In addition to including the salary range the tables also indicate the pay span and the extent of the overlap as well as the number of pay points and steps between the grade minimum and maximum.

| Table 3-Current Pay Table |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Pay <br> Band | Minimum <br> SCP | Minimum <br> Salary | Maximum <br> SCP | Maximum <br> Salary | Span | Overlap | Salary Points |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Points | Steps |  |
| Band 1 | 5 | 16,881 | 6 | 17,094 | $1.26 \%$ | $18.68 \%$ | 2 | 1 |
| Band 2 | 5 | 16,881 | 10 | 18,021 | $6.75 \%$ | $18.77 \%$ | 6 | 5 |
| Band 3 | 8 | 17,556 | 16 | 20,034 | $14.11 \%$ | $38.80 \%$ | 9 | 8 |
| Band 4 | 12 | 18,444 | 20 | 22,542 | $22.22 \%$ | $22.76 \%$ | 9 | 8 |
| Band 5 | 18 | 21,255 | 26 | 26,910 | $26.61 \%$ | $30.34 \%$ | 9 | 8 |
| Band 6 | 23 | 24,630 | 32 | 32,145 | $30.51 \%$ | $20.09 \%$ | 10 | 9 |
| Band 7 | 30 | 30,285 | 39 | 39,543 | $30.57 \%$ | $20.09 \%$ | 10 | 9 |
| Band 8 | 37 | 37,266 | 46 | 48,600 | $30.41 \%$ | $17.72 \%$ | 10 | 9 |
| Band 9 | 44 | 45,828 | 54 | 61,467 | $34.13 \%$ | $23.72 \%$ | 11 | 10 |
| Band 10 | 52 | 57,957 | 60 | 72,756 | $25.53 \%$ |  | 9 | 8 |

3.2 The Pay Span is defined as;

Maximum Salary - Minimum Salary / Minimum Salary * 100\% = Pay Span
E.g. Band $1=£ 17,094-£ 16,881=£ 213 / £ 16,881$ * $100 \%=1.26 \%$
3.3 The extent of the Overlap is defined as;

Maximum Salary of Lower Grade - Minimum Salary of Higher Grade
As a percentage of
Maximum Salary of Higher Grade - Minimum of Higher Grade
E.g. Band $1=$
$£ 17,094-£ 16,881=£ 213$
£18,021-£16,881 = £1,140
$£ 213$ as a percentage of $£ 1,140=18.68 \%$
The current overlap ranges from 17.72\% (Band 8) to 38.80\% (Band 3)
3.4 Although there has been a change to Band 1 which has been reduced in length by removing the lower spine points the fundamental concerns with the pay and grading structure remain. These are primarily;

- the percentage pay span
- the number of increments in each grade; it could take up to 10 years to achieve the maximum salary point whereas it is recommended that the achievement of service related benefits should take no more than five years
- the use of overlapping points across grades
3.5 The use of overlapping grades whereby the same spinal points feature in consecutive grades is extensive. This creates the potential that an employee paid in Band 3 could be paid significantly more than an employee in Band 4. An employee paid at the maximum point of Band 3 ( $£ 20,034$ ) could be paid up to $£ 1,590$ more than an employee at the minimum of Band $4(£ 18,444)$ despite their role having been evaluated at a lower level.
3.6 The extent of the issue that arises as a result of the overlapping points is shown in Table 4.

Table 4-Bands 1-10-Distribution by Spinal Point and Grade

| Spine <br> Point | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Band } \\ 10 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 9 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 8 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 7 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 6 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 5 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 4 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Band } \\ 3 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 2 \end{gathered}$ | Band 1 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 24 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 25 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 26 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 27 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 28 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 30 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 31 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 32 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 33 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 34 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 35 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 36 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 37 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 38 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 39 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 40 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 41 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 42 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 43 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| Table 4 - Bands 1-10-Distribution by Spinal Point and Grade |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Spine <br> Point | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 10 \end{gathered}$ | Band 9 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Band } \\ 8 \end{gathered}$ | Band 7 | Band 6 | Band 5 | Band 4 | Band 3 | Band 2 | Band 1 |  |
| 44 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 45 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 46 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 47 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 48 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 49 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 50 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 51 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 52 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 54 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 55 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 56 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 57 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 58 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 59 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 60 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## 4. Gender Pay Gap

4.1 Table 5 illustrates the Gender Pay Gap based on Basic Pay only for each individual pay band in Bands 1 to 10. We have used Pay Band on the basis that roles have been evaluated and therefore roles that fall within each band are considered as Work Rated Equivalent.
4.2 Despite the length of each grade and a pay span which in many cases exceeds $30.00 \%$, the gender pay gap does not exceed $5.00 \%$ in any grade with the exception of Band 9. The guidance issued by the Equalities and Human Rights Commission states that wherever there is a pay gap of more than $5.00 \%$ that this should be investigated.
4.3 We have looked at the average length of service for males and females in Band 9. The average length of service for males is 6.07 years and for females is 7.87 years. Although female employees have the greater average service; more male employees are paid at point 54 ( $16 / 29$ or $55.17 \%$ ) compared to female employees ( $8 / 31$ of $25.81 \%)$. This has the effect of increasing the average male hourly rate. The reasons for this could include the rate or pay progression or differences in starting pay or time in post at this band.

| Table 5-Gender Pay Gap - Mean - Basic Pay |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | ---: | ---: |
| Equal Work <br> Group | All Males |  | All Females |  | Difference |  |
|  | Total | Avg Basic <br> Hourly Rate | Total | Avg Basic <br> Hourly Rate | Difference <br> (£) | Pay Gap (\%) |
| Band 1 | 5 | 8.79 | 78 | 8.81 | -0.02 | $\mathbf{- 0 . 1 3}$ |
| Band 2 | 15 | 9.12 | 45 | 9.17 | -0.05 | $\mathbf{- 0 . 6 2}$ |
| Band 3 | 20 | 9.67 | 296 | 9.79 | -0.12 | $\mathbf{- 1 . 2 4}$ |
| Band 4 | 222 | 10.51 | 259 | 10.79 | -0.28 | $\mathbf{- 2 . 5 8}$ |
| Band 5 | 98 | 12.94 | 256 | 12.82 | 0.12 | $\mathbf{0 . 9 2}$ |
| Band 6 | 85 | 15.51 | 213 | 15.38 | 0.13 | $\mathbf{0 . 8 7}$ |
| Band 7 | 94 | 18.97 | 160 | 19.06 | -0.09 | $\mathbf{- 0 . 4 8}$ |
| Band 8 | 62 | 23.78 | 93 | 23.71 | 0.07 | $\mathbf{0 . 2 8}$ |
| Band 9 | 29 | 29.83 | 31 | 28.25 | 1.58 | $\mathbf{5 . 2 9}$ |
| Band 10 | 16 | 35.34 | 22 | 34.96 | 0.38 | $\mathbf{1 . 0 7}$ |
| Total | $\mathbf{6 4 6}$ | $\mathbf{1 5 . 4 5}$ | $\mathbf{1 , 4 5 3}$ | $\mathbf{1 3 . 9 4}$ | $\mathbf{1 . 5 1}$ | $\mathbf{9 . 8 2}$ |

Table 6 illustrates the gender pay gap based on basic pay using the median point. As can be seen the overall gender pay gap increases from $9.82 \%$ to $11.14 \%$.

| Table 6 - Gender Pay Gap - Median - Basic Pay |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Equal Work Group | All Males |  | All Females |  | Difference |  |
|  | Total | Median Basic Hourly Rate | Total | Median Basic Hourly Rate | £ | \% |
| Band 1 | 5 | 8.75 | 78 | 8.81 | -0.06 | -0.63 |
| Band 2 | 15 | 9.04 | 45 | 9.34 | -0.3 | -3.32 |
| Band 3 | 20 | 9.56 | 296 | 9.68 | -0.12 | -1.25 |
| Band 4 | 222 | 10.08 | 259 | 11.02 | -0.93 | -9.27 |
| Band 5 | 98 | 13.15 | 256 | 12.96 | 0.19 | 1.45 |
| Band 6 | 85 | 16.18 | 213 | 15.7 | 0.48 | 2.96 |
| Band 7 | 94 | 19.32 | 160 | 19.32 | 0 | 0 |
| Band 8 | 62 | 25.19 | 93 | 24.46 | 0.73 | 2.89 |
| Band 9 | 29 | 31.86 | 31 | 28.33 | 3.54 | 11.1 |
| Band 10 | 16 | 35.65 | 22 | 35.16 | 0.49 | 1.38 |
| Total | 646 | 13.15 | 1453 | 11.68 | 1.46 | 11.14 |

